

## CONCLUDING REMARKS ON THE PAPER: THE EFFECT OF EXTERNAL DAMPING ON THE STABILITY OF BECK'S COLUMN [1]

THE authors wish to acknowledge the remarks of Professor Nemat-Nasser regarding this brief note. His remarks are not of a technical nature, but rather seem to indicate that the authors either were unaware or chose to disregard the previous contributions of Professor Nemat-Nasser.

The authors were well aware of the contributions of Professor Nemat-Nasser; indeed, the original note referenced Ref. [2] of Professor Nemat-Nasser's remarks. In this reference nowhere does the statement appear, or for that matter is any indication given, that the critical load reaches a finite value as the value of the external damping becomes large. That a similar result could be obtained from some of the equations given in this reference is not in dispute. Professor Nemat-Nasser is right; the authors simply were interested in the behavior of the critical load as damping increased and Professor Nemat-Nasser's results, except implicitly, did not yield information in this regard.

Regarding Ref. [4] of the above remarks, the authors fail to see that the results are very pertinent: the frequency equations are not even of the same order. The fact that some asymptotic behavior is observed in some particular cases is obscured by the fact that the same asymptotic behavior is not observed in others.

In conclusion, the authors, in responding to Professor Nemat-Nasser's remarks, certainly do not wish to lay claim to originality of methods or techniques of the Note, whose purpose was to simply point out what seemed an interesting fact that to the authors' knowledge "seemed to have escaped other investigators". Professor Nemat-Nasser states that this fact had not escaped his attention; all the authors can do is to offer their congratulations.

*Center for Dynamical Systems,  
Division of Applied Mathematics,  
Brown University,  
Rhode Island 02912*

R. H. PLAUT  
E. F. INFANTE

### REFERENCE

- [1] R. H. PLAUT and E. F. INFANTE, *Int. J. Solids Struct.* **6**, 491-496 (1970).